STUDY OF ELECTRIC RATES AND RATEMAKING

BY

G. A. BARRER

S. SHAFFER

ARMOUR INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
1915



Illinois Institute
of Technology
UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES

AT 360 Barrer, G. A. Study of electric rates and ratemaking

For Use In Library Only







STUDY OF ELECTRIC RATES AND RATEMAKING A THESIS

PRESENTED BY

GLEN A. BARRER

AND

SYDNEY SHAFFER

TO THE

PRESIDENT AND FACULTY

OF

ARMOUR INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

FOR THE DEGREE OF

BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING

HAVING COMPLETED THE PRESCRIBED COURSE OF STUDY IN

ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING

1915

E. H. Freeman
Prof. of Elich. Eng.



CONTENTS.

Introduction	1.
Requirements of a Successful Rate System.	6.
Rate Forms and Their Characteristics	8.
Flat Rates	9.
Straight Meter Rates	10.
Demand Meter Rate	11.
Two Charge Rate	12.
Three Charge or Doherty Rate	16.
Factors Influencing Ratemaking	17.
Diversity Factor	19.
Demand Factor	25.
Basis of a System of Rates	27.
Municipally Operated Central Station	34.
Relation of Public Utility Commission	
to the Rate Question	35.
Tables	40.
Bibliography.	

	y million state of
	* 100til 1.0 7 mm 1 1
	, -1 +0 1 -+0 1 -+0 2 4 1 1 1 - 1 1 1 3 0 - 1 1 1 0 1 1
. 1	
.07	
٠_ ٢	
, 3 <u>,</u> T	Three Colors of the Colors
	הוו בילכל שהבספיבורו והוינס
	Merentar rotor volument
. ()	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	The same of the mark of the same of the sa
.00	
	1411 1219.



STUDY OF ELECTRIC RATES AND RATEMAKING.

The subject of Electric Rates has been studied in a great many different lights and has been discussed by a great many able men. space has been given to it in the trade journals and in the proceedings of engineering societies. and it is still a live subject of wide interest. The spread of the movement for regulation of public utilities and the consequent necessity for an equitable and scientific method of fixing rates, particularly for electric energy, gives additional importance to the subject. Accordingly, the authors have undertaken to make a general study of the subject, as it is presented in the trade journals and proceedings of engineering societies, primarily with a view toward increasing their own knowledge but hoping that they may be able to present an unbiased resumé of what

Market at the

The Student of Teach of the State of the Sta and any other transfer of the board of the b יום ביו ליום להתרוור וובד ני יו דב בי ני ביום ני וודיים. and production of the contract of the contract of The same of the state of the same of the s with the contract of the contr Deriver a control of the realism of the property with a second soft and and of processing and the second and the special -alle of the arter of the arter of the terminal terminal at the common of the co has been said and done in this field, for the benefit of others who may be interested.

Before any concrete examples are taken up, it will be well to consider the situation in general in order to obtain an insight into the conditions under which Central Stations operate and the nature of the problems with which ratemakers must deal. In the first place, the Central Station is engaged in producing electrical energy from coal, water-power or other source and in distributing and selling the energy produced to be used for a variety of purposes, by different classes of In this statement alone are consumers. involved enough variables to indicate the difficulty of making any generalization with regard to the selling price of energy that could be applied equitably to all cases; there are the wide differences in the cost of mach. I LINE IN BELL TRUNCE FOR THE

Lar both of doug in the rest.

-ar both of there is a continuous for the rest.

-- 'a ac iliamin 'com a da que de de signorial and the or the statement and the open the miltimation of the ethicage nion rate in the fire real day noing place, he car i bulgo car of the ting the standard of the stand or other source order of the ring and to to in, the prompt of the formation and the TO THE STATE OF TH composite. In the contract of the composite of על ליולר פי און בי על בור ווביו בים היים בים בור Gir principal of the sale of the trails day yet a could had for ever on at the only of alderer of the od place we the tile of the good of the ait and

STUDY OF ELECTRIC RATES AND RATEMAKING. 3. inery and labor required to produce the marketable product, in cost of distributing systems to deliver the product to the consumer, and in cost of equipment the company must install to take care of the demands of individual consumers and classes of consumers. Then there is the all-important distinction of electric energy supply and most other forms of public utilities that makes the subject of electric rates so troublesome, that is, the inability to economically store electric energy. Because of this fact, a Central Station must carry sufficient generating equipment, in working order, to supply the maximum demand of it's consumers at any instant, even though a large part of the equipment must lie idle for the greater part of the day, and some of it for a large part of the year. The fact that the maximum demands of the

ma make of the man make the contract petron with a larger of the state of the sta - Control of the second of the passed in all on the trans of the passe the pay to the training of the state of the the state of the total and the state of the of the Annala principal roll and not various consumers do not come at the same time brings in the Diversity Factor of the system, one of the most important factors in making a system of rates which will insure a fair return on the investment and at the same time a fair division of the costs among the consumers.

On the other hand, a system of rates, as presented to consumers who are not expected to study deeply into the subject, must be so easily understood that there will be no tendency to antagonize particular classes because of apparent discrimination, or to arouse unjust suspicion on account of indefiniteness.

In the early days of the Central Station business, the object of station managers was to charge what could be obtained for energy varying the rates whenever it was thought possible to get a higher rate or necessary to give a lower rate to get business. In other

Stoff nongloss, or of on other nongloss, or of one of the store of the

words, they based their rates solely on "what the traffic would bear." Under conditions of free competition such a policy would be very likely to work out equitably to all concerned because the user would be able to choose and the seller would be obliged to keep his charges at cost plus a reasonable profit. or be obliged to quit because of working at a loss with many consumers or at a good profit per consumer but with too few consumers. However, the supply of electric energy is by nature a monopoly, i.e. the public receives better and cheaper service from a company properly conducted as a monopoly than under competition. This is obvious if we assume that in both cases a fair return on the investment is made. If a fair return on the investment isnot being made, conditions are unstable, and unsatisfactory service will result,

TUR" OF RT TEEL DOOR TO FILE the farming that a -- a light out and infilling reflor using the fill of the many for factor of the state of the first and wall in the following the beautiful be and the TO M O TO STATE OF THE FIRST THE FOR THE STATE OF STATE O A Library Communication of the formula the e is pute a secure timp it both ne in the fittern and a series of the accident partice of our sures, is a track to agree The state of the s comment of the second of the s the first course return on the invier--IL of no days to the .are in the can ab mottlinum, i i entem jest tor . In T. I to the color of the c with the public the loser. Where a monopoly exists, a charge based solely on "what the traffic will bear" will manifestly lead to unfair conditions. However, it must be recognized that every practical rate system must be devised with considerable attention to this factor or it cannot meet the requirements of a successful rate system as enumerated in the next paragraph.

Requirements of a Successful Rate System.

Every student of the subject has put forth his opinion of what constitutes a successful rate system, in different forms and in different terms and it is attempted in what follows to make a statement of the requirements of a successful system that represents the consensus of opinion on the subject.

A successful rate system in its ultimate form must

the sect of subtle

- (1.) Be fair and equitable to both consumer and producer, i.e. it must approximate, -(no practical rate could more than approximate) - the cost of the service and energy which the consumer uses plus a reasonable profit; and furnish a reasonable return on the investment.
- (2.) Be equitable to all classes of consumers.
- (3.) Be in a form simple enough for the public to understand and appreciate.
- (4.) Provide for a healthy growth of the system.

 This last is an important factor, because no Central Station can afford to continue growing in a direction that will increase its expenses at a greater rate than its income. It must encourage the classes of load that increase its plant factor.

- end process recommendation of the second process
- The many of the state of the st
- The local test of the state of

Rate Forms and Their Characteristics.

In the order of their development, the various general classes of rate forms and their characteristics will now be taken up. All of the rate systems discussed in the following table are subject to wholesale discounts and discounts for prompt payment. It has been found that the public has no difficulty in understanding wholesale discounts or discounts for prompt payment. When the latter , which amounts only to a provision for the extra expense incurred in the collection of late bills, is put in the form of a penalty to be added to the bills, it meets with much disfavor, and where tried has been discontinued.

, and the second second in the second second in, after other pursuits crame and other are and a second property of The state of the s at the first of the second and the s of the state of th -Fin sightfoor cofineratedon or thought The state of the s The states of a set his seav Al Asymptotic transfer of the section of the sectio and the state of t . If the set of the second of the second of the second THE STATE OF THE S

Flat Rates.

The flat rate was the first system to be used because there were no satisfactory meters in the early days of the Central Station. Under the flat rate system, rates were based on the connected load, number of lights, rating of motors, etc. The expense of meters was avoided. and simplicity of bookkeeping and billing were other good points. It failed to comply with good business principles since such a rate could not possibly be fair to the marketing of a commodity such as electric energy, where the cost is made up largely of service cost, the cost of the energy cost being often secondary. Furthermore, it does not promote economy in the use of energy by consumers, nor encourage the growth of the Central Station in the right direction.

The use of the flat rate is by no means obsolete, for they have their value in

. 100, 145

the first of the first of the state of the s HE WINDS AND THE PARTY OF THE PARTY OF THE PARTY. and the second of the second of the second of SELF OUT TO BE DEFICION TO THE PARTY OF THE Last 1920 - Terr Track as Libertal Burns of Spec-The state of the s

and the state of t

dealing with certain classes of consumers, particularly for residence consumers in small towns and villages. Flat rates are valuable in building up the load on a high voltage network supplying a large number of small villages. They are most successfully used in connection with current-limiting devices. Many large Central Stations offer flat rates as optional rates in residences.

Straight Meter Rate.

When good meters became cheap enough to make their use general, the waste occasioned by flat rates was done away with by selling energy at a straight metered rate. This gave rise to a new evil because the consumer often increased his connected load and consequently his maximum demand far in excess of the average on which the rate had been based. The Central Station suffered by having to

design the destruction and as as as record, a second of the second of th

rotter tend total

The control of the co

install extra generating capacity without an increase in their income.

Demand-Meter Rate.

The next advance was a decided step toward a rational basis of rates. A rate system based directly on the cost of supplying the individual consumer is the theoretically ideal system and any step in this direction is very likely to be in the right direction. Certain expenses, such as interest on investment, depreciation, etc., are closely dependent on the maximum demand on the station and hence on the maximum demand of the consumer, though the Diversity factor intervenes between the station maximum and the consumers maxima. It is evident, however, that the capacity of Central Station required will be a function of the consumers' maximum demands. This was recognized when the Demand-Meter rate

And the same of th

141 141 1410 --

mind of the contract of the co The control of the control of the and a second sec , 10000 0 0 0 0 I O LITTLE OF THE THREE PRINTINGS

was introduced, in which the charge per kilowatt hour is based on the maximum demand of the consumers installation as measured by an indicating maximum - demand meter.

Two Charge Rate.

who first had the making of the rates to do, were bound by custom to make a rate that would be in a form familiar to the public in order that their efforts to sell their energy should not be met with suspicion because of a lack of understanding. For example, it would be extremely difficult to make the people who were accustomed to paying a definite price for their articles, whether bought by one or a dozen, to see that they should pay 12¢per kilowatt hour for the first 15 kilowatt-hours they used and then only 5 or 6 cents for the rest. This was the situation in the beginning of the

An in it is a common of the co

THE UNKERS LICH.

and the first of the state of t

Central Station business. Hence it was by way of educational work that the first multiple rate systems were introduced in the form of the two-charge rate, in which part of the energy is charged for at a high rate based on the maximum demand and the lower rate applied to the remainder. Various types of meters have been used to indicate the maximum demand of an installation, the most widely used being the Wright demand-meter, which indicates the maximum demand directly in kilowatts and is used in connection with the usual integrating watthour meter. The instrument records only such peaks as last for an appreciable time, such as five to ten minutes, responding only slightly to short peaks. However, the use of such instruments for every consumer would mean a very serious addition to the already high meter investment

Unchabit to the property of the termination of the A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH The man at a solo and an experience of the About the tild a territorials of the same at the second one bas became when the ending the community. Very the time of Table Made and . markety hard to be min ab Will a manufacture of his form the many is MET 1 TO LESS OF THE PARTY OF T THE CALL COLORS OF STREET STREET, STREET STREET

required for residence installations. As stated in another section of this paper, the meter investment for this class of consumers is often higher than the corresponding cost of station equipment. Accordingly, there is good reason for avoiding this expense and the tendency for some time back has been to use non-instrumental methods for getting at the small consumers' maximum demand. Some of the methods are:

- (1.) Determining the demand from the connected load.
- (2.) From the connected load, but omitting certain conveniences such as lamps in closets and out of the way corners.
- (3.) From the connected load, but omitting desirable off-peak appliances suchas flat-irons, desk fans, etc.
- (4.) The number of rooms in a house.
- (5.) The area to be illuminated.
- (6.) The valuation of the house.

- ATTRACTOR OF THE STREET AND ADDRESS OF THE STREET ADDRESS OF THE STREET AND ADDRESS OF THE STREET ADDRESS OF THE STR
 - - Albert Committee of the committee of the
 - 10/00-211-00-1-00-07-1.0
 - PRINCIPLE OF THE LABOUR STREET, NAME OF THE PARTY OF THE

The Commonwealth Edison Company of Chicago, after using the Wright demand-meter in a great many different classes of installations for a few years, has dispensed with the meters and use the average data obtained in each class of service for estimating the maximum demand. There is another advantage in the non-instrumental methods of estimating demand in that they encourage the use of appliances that help to fill in the valleys in the load curve and increase the diversity factor at the same time. The ordinary maximum-demand meter does not take into account the time of day at which the maximum occurs.

The second positive and accommon to the selpen and mile selection and selection to seem to the second to the second THE RESERVE THE PARTY OF THE PA I DESCRIPTION OF THE RESTREET - I golden trought sources to make more control of the later of the later of the control of of the company of the the state of the s The Three-Charge or Doherty Rate.

In the three-charge system, the fixed charges are subdivided into a consumer charge depending only on the number of consumers, and a demand charge based on the consumers' maximum demand. In it's simple form this method probably comes nearer to paralleling the consumer's actual cost than any of the other simple rate forms described above. The Doherty system was brought out in 1900, and since then has found wide use in companies operating under very different conditions.

There has been considerable demand for standardization of rate forms throughout the country and the National Electric Light Association through it's Rate Research Committee has expressed itself as in favor of the movement and put forth a set of standard forms for the guidance of public utility commissions and

for the use of the member companies of the association. At present most of the large companies have different rate forms, many of them very well designed to give the necessary simplicity combined with a proper apportionment of the costs. It is obvious that almost any of the enumerated rate forms when combined with various quantity discounts, step rates, block rates, etc., in different degrees can be made to give the same general result as far as actual rates are concerned. It would serve to implant confidence were these various systems made uniform throughout the country since it would help to educate the public to the real status of the Central Station business.

10 42

Arrived the second of the second

120 de The street of the street of the street of and the state of t mitter of the control of the section on the life one of the section of the reason of a second of the line out it the region of the property of the contract of the min war to program to a sect to the cold I FIRE Williams and a source of the same THE WAY AND THE THE PARTY OF TH T : Line of the second of the first of the second of . 1 10 5.1 1 g. harte Sex old FACTORS INFLUENCING RATEMAKING.

Before taking up these factors which are concerned with the maximum or peak load. something might be said as to the length of time duration of peak. The peak may be considered for any length of time as, momentary, one minute, five minute, 15 minute, hour, or, were we considering the year, one day might be considered the peak of the curve. The peak to be used under a given condition is variable. If the plant is a hydro-electric one, peaks of one minute are not too short to seriously overtax the plant if it is working well up to full load. On the other hand, an ordinary steam plant can easily carry an overload of 25% for an hour or 50% for 15 minutes without undue strain. Therefore a peak of short duration which is sufficient to severely overtax a hydro-electric station, has little

, to the to the state of CONTRACTOR AND ADDRESS OF THE PARTY AND ADDRES Letter and the second section of the second Affilia In the tent of the tent of real, a las reals and along that in the region of the party of the second state of the second THE RESIDENCE OF THE PARTY OF THE PARTY. effect upon the steam plant. It is this fact coupled with the flexibility of location which enables a steam plant to undersell the hydro plant.

With the ordinary steam plant it is customary to take the peak as that indicated by the Wright maximum-demand meter for commercial lighting loads. The length of time of this peak varies somewhat with the size of the peak, but may be taken as approximately a 15 minute peak. For railway service, wattmeters which record their readings every half-hour or hour, by printing the reading upon a paper tape, are often used. For street lighting, the peak is the total connected load and extends over the time the lights are in operation.

sfiet, the factories about of present or continue of and or continue of the co

All the ordinant characterists of the part of the part

DIVERSITY FACTOR.

Diversity factor, as defined by the standardization rules of the American Institute of Electrical Engineers, is the ratio of the sum of the maximum power demands of the subdivisions of any system or parts of a system to the maximum demand of the whole system. or of the part of the system under consideration measured at the point of supply. Its definition might be stated as the ratio of the sum of the peaks to the peak of the sum, for any division of the system. Diversity factor as concerning the Central Station, may be between the Central and substation, between substation and feeders, between feeders and transformers, or between transformer and consumers. All of these Diversity factors influence the cost and size of equipment, and it is this which determines the fixed

Production of the second secon sit " and set of the property of the particular to as the to mediate wind that her by my and the second s mineron many than Week or in the tol to to -1200 Harris Strategies, and the contract A COLUMN TO THE PARTY OF THE PA

charges. In the opinion of Mr. L. A. Ferguson of the American Institute of Electrical Engineers. "The Diversity factor is the very foundation rock of centralized energy supply. It is the birth-right of theCentral Station, the fundamental reason for its existance." It is one of the most important factors which enables a Central Station to install transmission lines, transformers and sub-stations. and still deliver power upon a consumer's premises at a charge less than the actual cost of generating the power upon the premises. Diversity factors vary with the type of load, the time of year, and the habits of the people. The society man burns his light in the evening, the milkman in the morning, and the same apparatus in the Central Station can generate both. This is only typical of the varying habits of the people,

of the to contitue of the care in the internal contract of - Junis thick to ex of sentucial more than . It is the interest of the second of the The second of the contract of the second of It to one of the root import . , man an el english to the transfer of the on dill leliver correctors (or our c'ar men men ; chart that the sen sen east of grounding the nome in the yne or lose, L. - timo gerr, alli = 1 V D of the median off ... almed safe of the standard . The standard of The second of the second second second second second the tion comercial tout. It's the . a cou on the wings of the facility which results in a large diversity factor, and a large saving in Central Station equipment.

Any attempt to give an average Diversity factor for any class of service is of little use, owing to the variation of the habits of the people in different localities. ever, in order to give some idea of how Diversity factors are computed and used in figuring the cost of delivering energy to a given point, two tables of Diversity factors are included in this article, and a third table to show how these factors effect the total investment per kilowatt of rated output for the examples These tables and the explanation given. of the same are taken from a report in the Electrical World (Vol. LVI, No.19) of a paper read by Mr. H. B. Gear at a meeting of the Association of Edison Illuminating Companies and is based upon determinations made for and

_ _ _ = n = re _ to ... To gramach tet. _ _ til. revie THE COURT OF THE PROPERTY OF T , or the management of the control to - with the tell the same of refere a traffic sitts that a series of the the second of the state of the other than יום ל סולי. ו "ווא בייניתר בוסכמר אורם בטוווים war to the second of the straight. ा है । उन्हें प्राप्त है। प्राप्त के प्राप्त है। map and a gir. W. Wi . for , first finite tours in the section of the section of the bull of the bull on the lines of the Commonwealth Edison Company of Chicago.

Group A (Table I) represents a residence block in which there are 34 consumers having a connected load of 18 kilowatts, or an average of .53 kilowatt per consumer.

The sum of the consumers maxima is 12 k.w., while the maximum as measured at the single transformer supplying this block is 3.6 k.w.

The Diversity factor is thus 3.33 between the consumers in the block.

Group B is a similar block having
185 consumers and in Group C about two-thirds
of the premises were small apartments and the
remainder large apartments and residences.
Demand indicators were used in determining the
maxima.

Among the commercial lighting consumers, Group D represents small stores on an

and the second s

AND THE STATE OF T

outlying business street, with several saloons and restaurants. In Group E there are no large stores, saloons, or restaurants, Group F includes nine apartments above stores and an equal number of offices, lodge halls, etc.

Among the general motor users,
Group H consists of 29 single phase motors
having a connected load of 27 H.P. and an
average load of 1.1 H.P. The sum of the
consumers maxima is 30 k.v.a., the transformer
maximum is 21 k.v.a. and the diversity factor
1.43. The consumers are "sweat shops", manufacturing mens' clothing.

Group I and K are small manufacturers.

In Group J the largest consumer is a woodworking establishment in which the machinery
operates steadily which accounts for the
high transformer maximum and the low Diversity
factor.

, all to the little has break

Table II gives various Diversity factors of the system.

Table III shows the total investment cost per k.w. of rated output for the different classes of service. These figures vary depending upon whether the consumers are close together or somewhat scattered. The figures given are computed, assuming the generating plant can be installed for \$100 a k.w. of rated output, substation and transmission lines for \$60 a k.w., feeders, mains, services, etc. at an average of \$150 a k.w. and meters at \$10 each.

Such business as refrigeration plants, bakeries, amusement parks and summer resorts, having their maximum demands occuring at different times from the residence lighting load, improve the Diversity factor of the Central Station and low rates are often made to secure this class of business, since it

The state of the s

requires practically no increase in generating equipment.

DEMAND FACTOR.

The demand factor is the ratio. expressed in percent, of a consumers maximum demand to his connected load. While the demand factor of the system determines the amount of equipment, it is of use in the determination of rates only when it is known for the different classes of service. small residence installation will have a higher demand factor than a large residence. while stores will have a much higher factor than either. The Wisconsin Railroad Commission have carried on a most comprehensive investigation to determine the demand factor for various classes of consumers. It gives the demand factor as approximately 40% for residences, flat, rooming houses, and public

and a control of the party of t

all pictures of the definition of the following the

buildings; 55% for schools, churches and factories; 75% for stores, offices, banks and saloons; and 100% for electric signs, hallways, and street lamps.

The demand factor determines the probable maximum from the connected load, which latter is easily obtained, and is of use in determining the rates for installations without demand-meters. The maximum load is what determines the amount of fixed charges to be apportioned to the consumer.

The load factor is the ratio of the average load to the peak load during a specified interval of time. The larger the diversity factor, the longer will the station be operating near its maximum capacity, the higher the load factorand the greater the output and consequently the greater the return on the fixed costs.

The second secon

content in a second of the content o

1. T. E. ... 1. to ... 1. to ... 1. to ... 1. to ... 1. ..

BASIS OF A SYSTEM OF RATES.

While the forms of rate systems vary from company to company, and even from branch to branch of the same company, there is not so much variation in the basis of the various rate systems for there are three distinct bases that can be used for a system of rates. These are, first, what the traffic will bear; second, value of the service; and third, the cost of the service plus profit. Although in the past it has been given more attention than any other factor, very little can be said in favor of the first as a basis for a Its only worth lies in its rate system. usefulness in connection with the third system as an aid in building up the valleys in the load curve by offering inducements to off-peak consumers. It might be called the leaven in a system of rates which is necessary The to the control of the control of the first of the contract of the contract of . 16[±] 12 10 12 8 2 11 110 1 10 1 18 1 . seed to street in Age , on , to Annual and the contract of the months of the the contract of the car of The first and the first of the of the tell of the first the sufference of device of all the printing of the mires. 14 + 10 1 - 10 1 3 V - - 10 L mll we for my and the party of the a the state of the

for growth but which must be used sparingly. The "value of the service" theory bases its rates on what the service is worth to the consumer and is closely related to the first basis. Such a system of rates would have to vary with every change in the industrial conditions and with the prices of raw materials. It would be impracticable except in some very special cases.

the cost of service as a basis for a system of rates is in accordance with the best business principles and is conceded to be the only logical basis. To find the cost of the service is not a simple matter and volumes have heen written and spoken on the methods to be used, since the principle has been in general use. A large part of the work of the public utility commissions has been along this very line, particularly

d year in the property of the control of the contro

to come a service of the service of

in evaluating the fixed capital investments of companies whose rates are under question with a view to determining the amount on which a return is to be allowed. There is such a great diversity of opinion as to what values should be taken into account and what weight shall be given to the various factors that are recognized, as to whether intangible assets such as "going value", franchises, etc., should be considered in making the valuation; and the available discussion on the subject is so largely disconnected and fragmentary. that the authors, in their inexperience, do not feel capable of analysing the situation and will limit their consideration of the subject to presenting part of a comparatively old outline made by Mr. H. L. Doherty before the Wisconsin Utility Commission. Any method of arriving at a valuation of a plant to be used in determining its permissible income

to swelcome or a contract of the contract of THE RESIDENCE OF THE PARTY OF T on form I all only cliff his owner highly The second secon took too to one to less at blood to be A CONSTITUTE OF A CONTRACT OF LEGI LEG THE WIND TO THE THE THE THE 00 ,000 15 seeped \$100 of , sep = set seed pulling on the service of the purpose of the SOUTH THE TENTH OF SERVICE THE COURSE of most and authorities a little of

must necessarily be based largely on personal opinion. Mr. Doherty has long been among the foremost recognized authorities in Central Station work and it is for this reason that his method is given here. His own words are used;

"Strange as it may seem there is no well defined method of determining valuation. It is often assumed that the entire difference between the physical value of a quasi-public corporation and its stock and bond value is represented by its franchise. Quoting from the report of the N.E.L.A. Public Policy Committee, 'A public service property can have a value aside from both the physical property and the franchise property, which is represented by many factors, among which are (a) operating organization, (b) development of business, (c) advantageous supply contracts. (d) special, general, and technical knowledge of the business on the part of the operators and directors, and (e)good-will."

He enumerates certain elementary points, which, though they may be difficult to determine, must be determined if a fair valuation is to be made. These are:

The second of th The course of the contract of the state of the s on all . You might be did

7 2 2 2 1 2 38 32 1 1 13 93 1 1 2 1 2 contil har set those or defending very firm the state of the s bet sop in a first of the ut of the terms of the of end of the second of the day relation to resulted of the relative states get . And was . C. . Just a Lampt out c. i, ter, '. The is set is an enty : 1 - 1 mile ent ito ing ships in a in coldy precions asigned that Authorities deen , a protopou grant to bett about it 10 pm - 10 201 pm - 10 החברים וו, ב בני בינ, אמנפריב,... כן זורים " I for (g) in , m in in it is in the state of

In delication, one to accept in 2 for the

- 1. How is valuation of property to be determined?
- 2. What allowance is to be made for ordinary depreciation?
- 3. What allowance is to be made for depreciation due to obsolescence caused by,

 (a) Outgrowth of apparatus before its useful life is realized?

(b) Changes in the art?

- 4. What allowance is to be made for risks due to
 - (a) Changes in the art which will render present investment valueless?
 - (b) Development of new art which will render investment valueless?

(c) Accidents?

5. What shall be considered as the expense for the interest on the money represented by the value of the plant?

6. What shall be allowed for profit?

"The operating company with which I am connected uses a certain method of computing the value of certain items of property and I recently had occasion to use this in the testimony given at a hearing on this problem. This method is as follows:

'Estimate of minimum value of Blank Company, computed on method used by Doherty Operating Co. and including no values for intangible assets, such as going concern, good-will, franchises, etc.

A. Real Estate.

B. Physical property(as per inventory at present or minimum value.)

C. Omissions, two percent.

- 1. Jon i velu ion of property to no deter-
- 2. What allowed in to be made for ordinar, dept shatten?
- . Ast allowers 1 to be made for derrect. tin deep consideration of a maratis of me light to religed.

1) Character to the anter

in to the tall unce is be nade for rists

(8) The second the rewhile of level second to the rest to the second the second to the

fili. ...i. fr nel in the left of the control of th

(c) recinits.

- b. The state of th
 - tille ioi broth a little .a

"" o in other services of the putiline of a companie the value of an interest of a companie of a companie of a companie of a companie of the companies of the c

' rist of single of single to the fill to the control of the contr

A. 13 1 8 .6 ta.

F. Ijrical projecty as er inventing at invent

4. Walliams, sic nercent.

- D. Engineering and supervision, 5% of B and C.
- E. Ordinary contingencies (not to cover omissions), 10% of B and C.
- F. Legal expenses, while building.
- G. Insurance risk while building;
 Public liability.
 Employees' liability.

Fire liability.

- H. Allowance for fact that property was built piecemeal, 10% of B,C, and D.
- I. Interest while building, 6% of A,B,C,D,E,F,&G.
- J. Excess value (based on average cost) of completed property in excess of value based on estimated time and cost of building, 10% of A.B.C.D.E.F.G.& I.
- K. Cost of organizing company, printing records, engraving stock and bonds, and miscellaneous.
- L. Working capital, stock accounts, unpaid bills.
- M. Unbilled gas and current, 5/30 of electric and gas total physical value.

Necessary expenditures other than for physical property.

- N. Expenses of operating organization prior to completion of plant.
- O. Operating expenses in excess of earnings during development period.
- P. Interest on investment in excess of earnings during development period, being one-half the interest for two years on A.B.C.D.E.F.G.J.& K. and 50% of L & M.

Q. Cost of developing business.

On page 353 of Vol. 52, of the

Electrical World, will be found some comment

- n. In the state of a property of the Police of the Police
 - - - : I to the will the series !

· .. / [] | 7,T | 1 | 0. | .. |

. Ilida. Ti

- . Intarcov and building 6 ..., ...
- - to the first case or a new control of the case of the

Translation of the state of the

- . Trenso o openio mento los color to a control control to the control control
-). Order there expends in early of the contract of the contrac
- - . United a troffiction for the

THE CO. TO STATE OF THE

on these various items, explaining the reason for each. Mr. Doherty's ideas on the subject of valuations may not be one-hundred percent correct but they are valuable for the clearness of his statements and the absence of ungrounded assumptions.

Uniform systems of accounting are required by some of the public utility commissions and constitute a valuable aid to such commissions in their work in determining a fair rate for any particular company within their jurisdiction. When uniform accounting was first required by the commissions there were many complaints raised by small companies who claimed that it would mean a hardship on account of the increased bookkeeping expense. It was found, however, that it was really a blessing in disguise for many leaks were located and remaddied that

on virtum steen, estimated on on on one of the control of the cont

34.

went unnoticed because of the lax accounting methods.

MUNICIPALLY OPERATED CENTRAL STATIONS.

About eight or ten years ago when the agitation against "trusts" and corporations was at its height, there was considerable demand for municipal operation of public utilities, including Central Stations. A study of the statistics of the United States Bureau of Census shows that while the number of Central Stations municipally operated has increased since 1907, the rate of increase has not been as rapid as the increase in total number of stations, nor has the amount of energy sold by municipal stations increased in anything like the increase of total energy sold. This indicates that municipal operation has not proven satisfactory, the increase in the number of stations probably being acTUDE OF STRIC PARKS A

Tast unsotined because of the execution methods.

MUNICIPALLY OFF OFF OFF

HOUTE OF THE TO THE SECOND the agitation of "stears" sail as noisating out Was no its height, there are and about demon't to mustered one the contract willtier, i eludi r Centre in the ... sudy of the totisics of the Thurston on the Pursen of Census Elows tiet will no mean iroreased since 1907, the rate of a rount hrs rot been as rario as the the mucher of tations, may are the great of in oft s. Isriotham rd blos who e to the line like the judgest the sail while you scla. This indicates that the in the miver of st time and ni

counted for operated in places that could not support a privately owned plant.

RELATION OF PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSIONS TO THE RATE QUESTION.

has lately become very popular throughout the country because of the success met with by the older commissions. Of the more important states now having commissions may be mentioned New York, New Jersey, Massachusetts, Wisconsin, Illinois, Maryland, California, and Ohio; a list that shows that the movement is country-wide. These commissions reflect the public tendency toward government regulation of industries that are monopolies by nature, and are doing good work in the direction of doing away with the unreasoning prejudice against large corporations merely on account of their

. . . . THE THE RESIDENCE TO LINE

یه دل دا و دیاده کا در <u>کرده)</u> دی وه خان در زرده کی دروره مشددا.

TO THE STATE OF THE STATE OF

 size. The organization and powers of the various commissions is much the same and the following outline of the organization of the Illinois Public Utility Commission is typical of all of them.

as railways, gas companies, and electric stations are each under the supervision of a separate branch of the commission, headed by one of the five appointed commissioners.

Each commissioner has his own assistants, all of whom will eventually come under the civil service rules, and he conducts hearings and issues orders subject to ratification by the commissioners is six years, no more than two to be appointed in any one year. The commission appoints its own legal adviser and secretary.

regions and the organization of the control of them.

Experience of filling and the control of the contro

The commission has power to prescribe the method of accounting to be used by utilities. to require monthly reports to the commission, and to say when a utility may issue stocks and bonds and other evidences of indebtedness. It has the power to make valuations and decide whether or not the rates and schedules are just and reasonable: and to regulate all relations between different companies operating public utilities. Complaints may be made by either citizens or companies and hearings and rehearings held if sufficient cause appears. Appeal from the decisions of the Commission may be taken to the Circuit Court, Sangamon County, and from there to the Supreme Court.

It is interesting to note that after a year of operation the commission has had but one of its decisions reversed by the courts and that one on a technicality having to do

The conduction and the conduction of the , in the second to the second the second The property of the property o to but the state of the state o THE TO THE SHIPTING AND TO THE TENTE tack one enjoyable one and good at a sec the fire of the stillier of institution - I the markets are allowed to any there told it sufficient same something in blud cand TOTAL COURT OF THE PARTY OF THE on the time Supreme to the supreme t

i i i intersitius to in a come of the state of th make a market of an things as in map day The sulve (Till summer or the foot can with the records of hearings.

That a properly conducted commission acts as a stabilizer for the utilities and has a beneficial effect on the relations between utilities and the public is clearly indicated by the powers invested in the commissions, and this indication has been fully borne out in the experience of those states having such commissions. The greatest difficulties of the commissions have been in the making of valuations, as might be expected. It is to be hoped that the joint efforts of the state commissions and the Interstate Commerce Commission will result in a standardization of the methods used in this important work and the standardization of accounting systems is certainly a step in the right direction.

There is little doubt that the future of the rate question lies with the

المراج المراجع المراجع

the property was and his in a little and not are widely a section memory and the second s could be arither at still by the contraction the state of the community of the state of t the same of the model of the farmer of DO ALL CLETT, BE SEED OF SELECTION to the entire many gift white many man wile it interprets (it is a month of the and the second of the second of the second of and the state of t million of ment & fire tile - at all Plant of tell regions to to the comments out our . mily the first of at come day, but the ord opening a feet of cent That is the merit of targett along the second to

state utility commissions and the direction of their development to date would seem to indicate that they are quite capable of doing justice to all concerned.

The file of the second second

TABLE I. Analysis of Consumers Diversity Factors.

Group	Number of Consumer	K.W. connected s consumer	Sum of Consumers Maxima		Diver- sity Factor
	RES	IDENCE LIGH	TING.		
A	34	.53	12	3.6	3.33
В	185	.53	68	20	3.40
C	167	.87	93	28	3.32
Averag	ge 128	.68	57	17.2	3.35
	COM	MERCIAL LI	GHTING.		
D	46	1.28	46	33	1.40
E	79	.74	36	26	1.40
F	160	.53	62	41	1.51
Averag	ge 95	.70	48	33	1.46
,	GE	NERAL MOTOR	SERVICE.		
H	29	1.1 h.p	. 30 kv	a.21 kva.	1.43
I	18	3.3	40	25	1.60
J	11	11.8	90	65	1.39
K	25	6	100	70	1.43
Averag	ge 21	4.5	65	45	1.44

CALL STREET, STREET, STREET, ST. OFFICE

using the manufacture of the lines

	- 0			2000 100 000	
-		.00		PAGE .	e Ha
	, "		M	1.7	
			66.		
			76.		10
. =	A.VE	4.	69.		1 10111
			12 411720		
- 2	100		2112	di	<u></u>
· —			ay.	77	
_ t	in	.)	M. W.	31	-
			49.		
	-	7 7 7	20701 L.co		
Ш.					10
. 1			5.8	15	
4 .1		J	0.55		
L)		4.		1,5	
. %	155	5	=,		-(ay_i

TABLE II. Diversity-factors of the System.

	Residence lighting	Commercia lighting	Motor service	Large users
Between Consumers	3.35	1.46	1.44	
Between Transformer	rs 1.3	1.3	1.35	1.15
Between feeders	1.15	1.15	1.15	1.15
Between Substations	3 1.1	1.1	1.1	1.0
Consumer to Trans.	3.35	1.46	1.44	
" " feeder	4.36	1.90	1.95	1.15
" " Substa.	5.02	2.19	2.24	1.32
" " Generato	or 5.52	2.41	2.46	1.45
corrected for los	sses 4.13	1.81	1.84	1.09

I day IT.

Si era't -factor or line at the

			eoratide No Sittiri	
	1 A _	14.5	1±9° /(0±0)	BE
1 3 4	7	3.1	ราคา เมื่อสามารถ เกาะเพร	67
170	12.1	97. 2	1.1 รากษอย แรกป	9F
	Pol	1 . I	್ಟ್ ಇವರ್ ಚಳಿಸಿಗಳು ಪ್ರ	88
top 'pri	1.	11 _{/*} E	asmer to Trails. J. =	20
=1.0	51.3	20.0	81 = ## ## "	
		1 , 2	11	
4.1	01.7	31.0	AF.G Sterone ' '	
w.J		9 da	Tive Street of the Colonia	

TABLE III. Investment in \$ per K.W. for Various Consumers.

	Residence lighting	Commercia lighting	l Motor servic	Large e users
Meters	124	38	15	
Transformers	12	12	12	8
Distributing lines	146	146	145	49
Substation & Trans	. 58	58	58	58
Generating equipmen	nt 100	100	100	100
Total investment	440	354	330	215

. Miller

In enthe it in , pur T. . for I To re-

		BIST TATA		Free states
		e,	ws area	
		= <u>L</u>	111 f ve iet _ 1	'O'
			No antimited	fa
	83	8.8	1	5,7
	0.10	CHE	of Justine all area	57
1,==	e)	177	two two for fur	

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

Engineering Magazine

Comparisons of systems of Charging for Electric Energy. 1910 p.47.

National Electric Light Association Proceedings.

Load Factors. E. W. Lloyd 1909Vol. 12 p.586.

Significance of Statistics

McKana and McGuire 1910 Vol. 2 p.291.

Rate Research Committee Reports 1912-13-14.

Statistics of United States Census Bureau 1914.

Institution of Electrical Engineers Proceedings.

Influence of Load and Diversity Factors on

Methods of Charging for Electric Energy.

Vol. 42, p.100

American Institute of Electrical Engineers Proc.

Rate Making Goldman May 1915.

Centralization of Power Supply*Ferguson

1909 p. 355.

Diversity Factor H.B. Gear 1910, p.375.

Electric Central Station Distributing Systems

Gear and Williams.

eller our chile.

The state of an investment of the state of t

Transport duests align, respectively.

Lack Section 1. Clays 130 Mil. 12 - 2.

. The state of the

Substitution of the substitution of the contract of the contra

infimure o Food ad diversity control of the control

N/.. . . . 107

Central sation of long to the sational design of the sation of long to the sation of t

. The control of the second of

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

Electrical World. Vol. 52.

Dougherty on Rates and Valuation pp. 171, pp. 331,352, 607.

Electrical World. Vol. 53. .

Central Station Accounting p.980.

Electrical World. Vol. 54.

Illinois Convention Discussion. p. 1293.

Mark's Sliding Scale. P. 557, 592.

Tendency Towards Flat Rates p. 512.

Electrical World. Vol. 55.

Diversity Factor p. 1102.

Decision on Valuation and Rates p.675.

Wisconsin Railway Commission Analysis of

Rate Question. p. 1660

Determination of Rates for Energy.

- Cravath. p. 1305.

Discussion of Ten Different Companies. p. 354.

. TEMPERSON

Jentrin L orla. Vol. 5.

ougherly on Salve and Wilmids of 191.

. . W. . fet . . eff " fautrosafe

Control Status conficient

. Alse Jorf

Divr of mount of rvid

Jetern - Too, in the me of , or -7-.

Transport of the Committee of

-. co. ac. (\$3. o noi) int = tac

A second of the different "to act mine in

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

Electrical World. Vol. 56.

Rates effective in 58 American Cities. p. 784.

Rates Based on Area Lighted. p.77.

Rate Schedules. p. 1048.

Diversity Factors. - H. B. Gear pp.1115,1212.

pp.1479.

Demand and Diversity Factors and their Influence on Rates. - Cravath. p. 567.

Active Lamp "Readiness to Serve" Charge. p.1528.

Electrical World. Vol. 57.

Complex Charge p.1048.

Flat Rates. pp. 520, 1343, 788.

Municipal Plants and Rate Systems. p.61.

Electrical World. Vol. 58.

Diversity Factor. C.J.Russel. p.553

Municipal Ownership and Rates. p. 1345.

Depreciation. pp. 323,636,454,757,455,506.

Flat Rates for Small Consumers. p.46.

Easily Understood Statement of Rates. p.1142.

.TI MIDDES !!

| Παιστής Επιστής | Παιστής | Παιστ

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

Electrical World. Vol. 59.

Theory upon which Rates are Based. p. 1298.

Average Rates in 36 Large American Cities.

p. 595.

Limiting Device for Flat Rates. pp.699, 1446.

Maximum Demand pp. 55,56,265.

Electrical World. Vol. 60.

Theory of Tariffs. pp. 271, 1056, 1107.

Solution of the Rate Problem. p. 516.

Charging for Electric Energy- Boston. p.720.

Electrical World. Vol. 61.

What the Service Will Bear. p.325.

Value of the Service Theory. p. 1277.

Rate-Making for Central Stations. p. 848.

Factors Determining a Reasonable Charge.

Depreciation as Affecting Valuation and a

Fair Return. p. 301.

... in the control of the control of

Value On the Control of the Control

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

Electrical World. Vol. 61.

Regulation and Municipal Operation. p. 809. Jurisdiction of Public Utility Commissions.

p. 1415.

Rate Schedules from Consumer's Standpoint.

pp.49,77,306.

Multiple Rate System. pp. 1085, 1070.

Classification of Customers. p. 352.

Buffalo Rate Cases. p. 1078, 1301.

Electrical World. Vol. 62.

Rate-Making - Intangible Valuts. p.123.

Problem of Rate Regulation p. 414, 410.

Valuation and Rate-Making. p.21.

Rates in Various Cities. pp. 746, 803.

Electrical World. Vol. 65.

Factors in Ratemaking - Ives. Mar. 13,27.

Apr. 17, 1915.

Reserve Funds for Central Stations.

May. 1, 1915.

.To .Ic. Issuet of.

. The variety of the man subsequents of the contract of the co

יים) בנפאינה ביים כי נשנה ב אירור נכון. יין אין יין, אור

The sector exclusion is the sector and a sec

..... is a newline pathward of the second of

, not 32 Landres of Lon . ise















